

Date:

August 13, 2012

To:

Melissa Adames

Procurement Contracting Manager Internal Services Department

From:

Dakota Thompson, CPPB Chairperson, Review Team

Subject:

Report of Review Team for EPP-RFP No. 823 Garbage Collection Routing Solution

The Review Team has completed the evaluation of proposals submitted in response to the referenced Request for Proposals (RFP) following the guidelines published in the solicitation as summarized below.

Committee meeting dates:

July 11, 2012 (Kick-off Meeting)

July 18, 2012 (Technical Discussion and Evaluation Meeting)

August 8, 2012 (Oral Presentation, Evaluation Meeting, and Final Scoring Session)

Verification of compliance with contract measures:

The Small Business Enterprise (SBE) Review Committee assigned a Selection Factor contract measure to this solicitation. This measure was not applicable to the proposals received, as none of the Proposers were eligible for this SBE preference.

Local Certified Service-Disabled Veteran's Business Enterprise Preference:

None of the Proposers who submitted responses are Local Certified Service-Disabled Veteran's Business Enterprises.

Verification of responsiveness:

The RFP opened on June 29, 2012 with three proposal responses. The proposal responses were reviewed for responsiveness by the Chairperson and the County Attorney's Office (CAO). The proposal submitted Waste Management Logistics was deemed as non-responsive by the CAO due to the firms submitted documents marked Confidential on front cover of submittal package, and Form B-1, Price Proposal Schedule. The proposal for this firm was not presented to the Review Team for review. A copy of the CAO opinion is attached.

The responsive proposals offered by Gershman, Brickner and Bratton, Inc., and RouteSmart Technologies, remained in consideration and were presented to the Review Team for evaluation.

Summary of scores:

The Review Team was tasked with evaluating, scoring, and ranking the two responsive proposals submitted in reference to the RFP. A technical discussion and evaluation meeting was held on July 11, 2012. After completion of a technical review of the proposals received, the Review Team conducted preliminary scoring.

Report of Evaluation/Selection Committee for EPP-RFP No. 823 Garbage Collection Routing Solution Page 2

Preliminary scores are as follows:

Proposer	Technical Score	Price Score	Total Combined Score (Max 300)	Price/Cost Submitted
	(Max 240)	(Max 60)	·	-
Gershman, Brickner & Bratton, Inc.	183	35	218	\$158,508
RouteSmart Technologies	183	35	218	\$154,500

Based on the initial evaluation, the Review Team elected to hold oral presentations to obtain clarification for the submission from the two proposers: Gershman, Brickner & Bratton, Inc. and RouteSmart Technologies. Following the oral presentations, an additional technical evaluation was held and final scoring was completed.

Final scores are as follows:

Proposer	Technical Score	Price Score	Total Combined Score (Max 300)	Price/Cost Submitted
	(Max 240)	(Max 60)	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	
Gershman, Brickner & Bratton, Inc.	184	45	229	\$158,508
RouteSmart Technologies	232	55	287	\$154,500

Negotiations:

The Review Team recommends that the County enter into negotiations with RouteSmart Technologies, the highest ranked, lowest priced vendor.

The following individuals will participate in the negotiations:

Dakota Thompson, CPPB, Internal Services Department

Theresa Fuentes-Smart, Public Works and Waste Management Department

Chris Rose, Public Works and Waste Management Department.

Justification for Recommendation:

A Request for Proposals was issued under full and open competition for interested and capable parties to provide a turn-key commercially available Garbage Collection Routing Solution (Solution), inclusive of all required software licenses, implementation, integration, configuration, training, maintenance support and associated services capable of optimizing garbage collection routes, balancing route times, and minimizing collection vehicle usage for the Public Works and Waste Management Department. After careful review of all submitted proposals and oral presentations, RouteSmart Technologies, was deemed the most capable for the project.

Report of Evaluation/Selection Committee for EPP-RFP No. 823 Garbage Collection Routing Solution Page 3

The Review Team unanimously recommends that RouteSmart Technologies be recommended to proceed with negotiations. The Solution proposed by RouteSmart is capable of meeting all of the requirements outlined in the solicitation and will provide the County with the best overall value.

Copies of the Evaluation Results Memo, score sheets for each Review Team member, as well as a composite score sheet, and County Attorney responsiveness opinion are attached.

Approved

Melissa Adames, CPPB

Procurement Contracting Manager